March 25, 2005

This attachment summarizes and lists examples of some of the reasons we are leaving the Adventist denomination. We have researched church literature, Adventist critics and apologists, self-proclaimed experts, historians, and most importantly the Bible. What we have found has led us to our decision. Much of our studying has focused on Ellen G. White and the relationship between her and the Seventh-day Adventist Denomination. We have given source references whenever possible to encourage the examination of our quotes in their original context.

The intention of this paper is to explain our decision and share what we have learned. Although it is critical of Ellen White and Adventism, it is not meant to denounce others' beliefs or to be mean-spirited toward the memory of Ellen White or to the Adventist denomination. Its purpose is to show some things we learned that both surprised and troubled us about Adventism in general and Ellen White in particular. Many Adventist evangelists we have heard are careful to preface their attacks on the Catholic Church and the papacy with the disclaimer that they are not attacking any individual. We were unaware, but recently learned, that Ellen White was not as apologetic with her criticisms of the Adventist brethren and even more vehement in her denunciation of those who differed from her particular beliefs and ideas, as shown by the following examples.

Ellen White was ruthless in her description of Thomas Paine (1737-1809), a leading figure and supporter of our American Revolution; a defender of democracy; author of the book <u>The Age of Reason</u> and the pamphlet *Common Sense*; and a professed deist who held to a theology differing from Mrs. White's:

"Thomas Paine, whose body has now mouldered to dust, and who is to be called forth at the end of the 1000 years, at the second resurrection, to receive his reward, and suffer the second death, is purported by Satan to be in heaven, and highly exalted there. Satan used him on earth as long as he could, and now he is carrying on the same work through pretensions of having Thomas Paine so much exalted and honored; and as he taught on earth, Satan is making it appear that he is teaching in heaven. And some on earth who have looked with horror at his life and death, and his corrupt teachings while living, now submit to be taught by him who was one of the vilest and most corrupt of men; one who despised God and his law." - EGW [emphasis added]

Neither did Ellen White shirk from criticizing the contemporary leaders of her country:

"I saw that these national fasts [that were called by Abraham Lincoln to pray for an early end to ² Ellen G. White, <u>Testimonies for the Church, Volume</u>

the Civil War] were an insult to Jehovah." "In view of all this, a national fast is proclaimed! Oh, what an insult to Jehovah!" – EGW [italics added]

Nor did she avoid labeling Lincoln's Civil War military leaders as *murderers* and *traitors*:

"Many of those who are placed high in command to fill responsible stations have but little conscience or nobility of soul; they can exercise their power, even to the destruction of those under them, and it is winked at. These commanders could abuse the power given them and cause those subject to them to occupy dangerous positions where they would be exposed to terrible encounters with the rebels without the least hope of conquering them. *In this way they could dispose of daring, thoroughgoing men, as David disposed of Uriah. 2 Samuel 11:14, 15.*3 –EGW [emphasis added]

Valuable men have thus been sacrificed to get rid of their strong antislavery influence. Some of the very men whom the North most need in this critical time, whose services would be of the highest value, *are not*. They have been wantonly sacrificed. The prospects before our nation are discouraging, for there are those filling responsible stations who are rebels at heart. *There are commanding officers who are in sympathy with the rebels.*" – EGW [emphasis added]

Unlike Ellen White, we do not claim to have received our information about Ellen White from any heavenly visions, but only from studying her writings, those of her associates and critics, her apologists, denominational documents, and denominational teachings, lectures and periodicals. Aside from her own writings, everything else we know about her is second hand; therefore we cannot judge nor do we criticize the intents of her heart nor her motives.

Summary

- (1) We will review what we see as the relationship between Ellen White and the Adventist church Conference, the denomination's leadership and to what extent her writings influence the denomination.
- (2) We will discuss whether her writings are a reliable source of information.
- (3) We will examine the denomination's teachings about the Sabbath and whether those teachings are Biblical.
- (4) We will relate some thoughts about the doctrine of the Cleansing of the Heavenly Sanctuary and the Investigative Judgment.

¹ Supplement to the Christian Experience and Views of Ellen G. White (1854), p. 7.

One, "The North and the South", p. 257. $\frac{3}{1}$ Ibid.

⁴ Ibid.

These four topics are not all-inclusive, but they are representative of the reasons for our leaving Adventism.

We have tried to reference every source of our information and encourage the reader to look up the sources personally to see them first hand and in their intended context.

Ellen White and Adventism

Ellen White's writings permeate all aspects of the Seventh-day Adventist denomination. The subject matter of the flagship book of her "Conflict Series", The Great Controversy, is the underlying basis of the frequent evangelistic Revelation seminars given by the church. Although her book is seldom directly quoted during the seminars, the historical claims, scriptural interpretations and prophetic timelines seem to mostly come from that book. Selected scriptural texts are often used, but we discovered they are frequently taken out of context, to support the many claims that are made in the seminars.

Although many of the church leaders and speakers never quote Ellen White directly, evidence of her teachings are apparent in the undercurrents of their sermons and lectures. Later, we will show an example from the 2004 "Revelation Offers Hope" seminar held at the "Prophesy Center" (the local Seventh-day Adventist Church). Sometimes Adventist leaders unapologetically proclaim Ellen White to be a true prophet and defend her writings. We will also examine one of their recorded lectures, given by Dr. Veith.

The writings of Ellen White are always available at the Adventist book stores and frequently sold at church services, Adventist gatherings and camp meetings. They are promoted from the pulpits. Sabbath services are sometimes based entirely on her writings.⁵ Biblical stories are often told as related by her from her visions. When we questioned colporteurs about her works, they responded that they were unquestionably inspired by God and contained only truth.

Ellen White's writings also permeate the teaching literature published by the church and her teachings are woven into the very fabric of Adventist doctrine. The fourth-quarter 2004 (13-week) Sabbath School quarterly "Daniel" contained no less than twenty-six Ellen White quotations, for an average of two Ellen White quotes per lesson. The official church teaching literature also promotes her writings by including advertisements for them. The Pacific Union Conference president quoted from The Great Controversy in his introductory

⁵ The ladies singing group in which I participated, often presented entire Sabbath morning programs based entirely on Ellen White's rendition of a Biblical story, interspersed with Christian music. I dearly loved singing with the group, and was heartbroken at what I learned about Ellen White. I felt that I could no longer support a ministry based on Ellen White, and so resigned.

"Perspective" column in the March 2005 issue of the *Pacific Union Recorder* ⁷. The Ellen G. White Estate, Inc., an arm of the Seventh-day Adventist General Conference, has as its primary purpose the preservation, translation, and distribution of royalties generated by Ellen White's writings. ⁸

If that is not enough evidence of the close relationship between Ellen White and the Adventist church, one only has to look at the official church statement of doctrines to see her influence. On the back of my Baptismal Certificate are listed the Summary of Doctrinal Beliefs. Belief number 20 states:

"The church is to come behind in no gift, and the presence of the gift of the Spirit of prophecy is to be one of the identifying marks of the remnant church (1 Cor. 1:5-7; 12:1-28; Amos 3:7; Hosea 12:10, 13; Rev. 12:17; 19:10.) Seventh-day Adventists recognize that this *gift was manifested* in the life and ministry of *Ellen G. White*." [emphasis added]

This Summary was revised during the Dallas General Conference Session of 1980 and published as "The 27 Fundamental Beliefs of the Seventh-Day Adventists". The Ellen White prophesy doctrine #20 became Fundamental Belief #17 and was modified as follows:

"The Gift of Prophecy: One of the gifts of the Holy Spirit is prophecy. This gift is an identifying mark of the remnant church and was manifested in the ministry of *Ellen. G. White*. As the Lord's messenger, her writings are a continuing and *authoritative source of truth* which provide for the church comfort, guidance, instruction, and correction. They also make clear that the Bible is the standard by which all teaching and experience must be tested. (Joel 2:28, 29; Acts 2:14-21; Heb. 1:1-3; Rev. 12:17; 19:10.) [emphasis added]

It is clear that Adventists do not uphold Ellen White as merely a church founder, Scriptural commentator, or spiritual leader. Instead, her writings are held as a "source

⁶ *Daniel*, Adventist Sabbath School quarterly (Pacific Press, 2004)

⁷ Tom Mostert, *Pacific Union Recorder*, Westlake Village, CA, March 2005, p. 4.

⁸ Material adapted slightly from the *Seventh-day Adventist Encyclopedia*, second revised edition (Hagerstown, Md.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1996), vol. A-L, pp. 503-506. see

http://www.whiteestate.org/about/estate.asp

⁹ "Certificate of Baptism", Prepared by the General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, Takoma Park, WA (no date given). Received from a local Seventh-day Adventist Church on November 17, 1984.

¹⁰ The SDA Church Manual, Chap. 3, p. 14. (http://www.adventist.org/beliefs/church_manual/chapter3. html) It is interesting that we have never seen these fundamental beliefs prominently displayed publicly.

of truth"; higher praise could not be given Holy Scripture itself. She is a self-proclaimed messenger of God.

"God was speaking through clay. You might say that this communication was only a letter. Yes, it was a letter, but prompted by the Spirit of God, to bring before your minds things that had been shown me. In these letters which I write, in the testimonies I bear, I am presenting to you that which the Lord has presented to me. I do not write one article in the paper expressing merely my own ideas. They are what God has opened before me in vision—the precious rays of light shining from the throne." 11—EGW [emphasis added]

"When writing these precious books, if I hesitated, *the very word* I wanted to express the idea was given to me." - EGW [emphasis added]

She further clarifies how she received and communicated those "precious rays of light":

"My work includes much more than this name [prophetess] signifies. I regard myself as a messenger, entrusted by the Lord with messages for His people.—Letter 55, 1905." — EGW [italics added]

"My commission embraces the work of a prophet, but is does not end there. It embraces *much more* than the minds of those who have been sowing the seeds of unbelief can comprehend.—Letter 244, 1906. (Addressed to elders of Battle Creek church.)" - EGW [emphasis added]

"I am just as dependent upon the spirit of the Lord in relating or writing a vision, as in having the vision. It is impossible for me to call up things which have been shown me unless the Lord brings them before me at the time that He is pleased to have me relate or write them.—
Spiritual Gifts (1860), vol. 2, pp. 292,293)."15 – EGW [emphasis added]

Some Adventists have told us that faith in Ellen White and her teachings are not necessary to join or remain in the Adventist fellowship. However, as seen from the few examples given, Ellen White's writings and Adventist teachings are inseparably intertwined.

One of the problems faced by Adventists today is that of trying to balance the spiritual advice of Ellen White with

common sense and today's living. She clearly teaches that Christians should shun the display of family photographs in the home, ¹⁶ the reading of newspapers and periodicals, ¹⁷ and spectating or participating in competitive sports. ¹⁸ In the March 2005 issue of the *Pacific Union Recorder*, Mr. Kermit Netteburg, the North American Division communication director, advises Adventists to eschew an "unbalanced life reflected [by] 'pick and choose' Christianity". ¹⁹ To this fault Mr. Netteburg attributes the downfall of recently accused murderer Marcus Wesson who has been identified as a Seventh-day Adventist. In his next paragraph, Mr Netteburg advises Adventists how to reassure friends and co-workers when they question Adventism.

"Perhaps the most appropriate response is that the Adventist life, like any Christian life, needs to be characterized by balance.

- We read the *Adventist Review*, and *Newsweek*.
- We go to church, and to community softball games."

Mr. Netteburg then advises,

"Learn the value of diversity in thinking. Read the Bible every day, and read a newspaper."

But should Adventists be reading Newsweek, newspapers and attending softball games? Or should Adventists be following the divinely inspired counsel of Ellen White instead of "picking and choosing" her counsels that best suit one's lifestyle?

Are Ellen White's Writings Reliable?

- A. Plagiarisms by Ellen White
- B. Prophetic Predictions
- C. Spiritualism
- D. Miller's Prophetic Time Predictions
- E. Amalgamation

A. Plagiarisms by Ellen White

¹¹ Ellen G. White, <u>Testimonies for the Church, Volume Five</u>, "The Testimonies Slighted", p. 67.

¹² Ellen G. White, <u>Selected Messages</u>, vol. 3, p. 51, 52).

¹³ Ellen G. White, <u>Selected Messages</u>, <u>Book I</u>, p. 36.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ Ibid., p. 37.

¹⁶ See *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, September 10, 1901 (Vol. 78, #37) "No Other Gods Before Me"; Ibid., March 26, 1867 "An Acknowledgement"; *Messages to Young People*, p. 316, 318.

¹⁷ See *Review and Herald*, December 11, 1879 par. 10.; Adventist Home, 1952, p. 403-404.

¹⁸ See *Review and Herald*, September 10, 1901 par. 5; Ibid., December 11, 1879 par. 10; Messages to Young People, p. 382.

¹⁹ Kermit Netteburg, *Pacific Union Recorder*, "Balanced Adventists" Westlake Village, CA, March 2005, p. 25.

The fact that Ellen White plagiarized other writers has been known by the Adventist General Conference since before 1919.²⁰ We did not learn this from Adventist sources, but only through our own recent research. Many long-time Adventists who we personally know have admitted that they were aware of this also. Mrs. White's plagiarism is sometimes renamed "literary borrowing" by her followers and excused for various reasons such as the following:^{21, 22}

- (1) "Everyone" was doing it during her era, even other religious writers (Not true. This is a childish excuse every parent has heard.);
- (2) She didn't know any better (But many of the works she copied from *did* give appropriate credits. She even copied information from others' footnotes that listed literary sources, as shown in our example following.);
- (3) It wasn't illegal back then (However the Eighth Commandment prohibits stealing and was written long before the 19th century.);
- (4) She gave much of the money she earned in royalties from her copied works back to Adventist work (But royalties were not given to the original authors, nor to their publishers, nor their estates. The White Estate continues to receive and distribute royalties to this day.);
- (5) Her critics also "borrowed" and are guilty of the same offense (But does that somehow justify her actions?);
- (6) She didn't borrow as much as the critics have claimed (But as research continues, more and more has been discovered, especially with the use of modern computers.);
- (7) Her prophesies were not "verbal" so she borrowed words from other previously "inspired" writers to better explain her visions (Yet she claimed that God helped her find the words she needed—see EGW quotation above where she stated that God gave her" the very word" she wanted to express her ideas.);
- (8) Her staff of copyists and editors didn't tell her they were copying (But she possessed and distributed those same books);

²⁰ Minutes of the 1919 Bible Conference can be found at http://christiancommunitychruch.us/dovenet/sda1919a.htm ²¹ See Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary (G. & C. Merriam Company, Springfield, MA, 1974) which defines "borrow" as "1: to receive with the implied or expressed intention of returning the same or an equivalent <~ a book> 2 a: to appropriate for one's own use <~ a metaphor>. " Since Ellen White did not return anything (such as due credit or royalties to the original author), her plagiarisms might have more accurately been renamed "literary appropriations".

²² See Ellen G. White and Her Critics by Francis D. Nichol (Review and Herald Publishing, 1951) Chapters 28 – 30 (pgs. 403 – 467) for an in-depth Adventist's defense of Ellen White's plagiarisms.

(9) It was the publisher's fault, not hers, for failing to credit her sources.

We believe that none of these excuses are reasonable and they are largely indefensible. Another defense of Mrs. White's divine inspiration is that she only had a third grade education. How could she have produced all of her wonderful written works with her lack of education and poor health? We believe the answer is simple,—she read a lot instead of going to school, and copied others' works! When The Great Controversy was re-published in 1911, the editors apparently tried to fix the plagiarism by adding literary credits. In all, we counted the addition of at least 372 credits for non-biblical passages from 75 different authors in the 1911 version of The Great Controversy. The previous 1888 publication had zero credits given.

We speculate that the other Ellen White works were not updated with credits because it probably took great effort and cost to identify all original sources that she failed to document. And with the way the Conference leaders have excused her copying, they probably realized that it makes little difference to most Adventists. Her personal library purportedly contained over 2,000 volumes and she probably copied from outside her personal collection also. It is even difficult to find many of her "borrowings" with modern computers because she often just copied the ideas but changed or rearranged the wording. The following is just one of many examples we discovered where she copied almost word-for-word.

We heard that she had copied from Conybeare and Howson. We were at first disbelieving that Ellen White had plagiarized so we located Conybeare and Howson's book through inter-library loan at our local Public Library so we could see for ourselves just what she had copied. Here is what Conybeare and Howson wrote:²⁴

"The judges sat in the open air, upon seats hewn out in the rock, on a platform which was ascended by a flight of stone steps immediately from the Agora." – p. 289.

"He had begun by attacking the national gods in the midst of their sanctuaries and with the Areopagites on the seats near him, he would have been in almost as great danger as Socrates before him." – p. 292.

²³ This is the only White publication that we are aware of that was corrected in this way. None of her other "Conflict Series" books were updated with appropriate credits.

²⁴ W.J. Conybeare and J.S. Howson, <u>The Life and Epistles of St. Paul</u> (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., Reprinted 1968 from 1855, 3rd ed.), pgs. 289, 292.

Then there is Ellen White's version of the identical scene:²⁵

"The judges sat in the open air, upon seats hewn out in the rock, on a platform which was ascended by a flight of stone steps from the valley below. At a little distance was a temple of the gods; and the sanctuaries, statues, and altars of the city were in full view." – EGW, p. 92.

"Had his oration been a direct attack upon their gods, and the great men of the city who were before him, he would have been in danger of meeting the fate of Socrates." – EGW, p. 97

Did Ellen White view this scene and get the idea to compare Paul and Socrates from a divine vision from God, as she claimed she got all her writings? Or did she get it from reading Conybeare and Howson? Where did Conybeare and Howson get their information? This is the very first of many plagiarisms that we were able to authenticate and it is a particularly interesting example because, unlike Ellen White, Conybeare and Howson even credited their own source in their following footnote:

[Conybeare and Howson's footnote number two on page 289] "The number of steps is sixteen. See Wordsworth's Athens and Attica, p. 73. 'Sixteen stone steps cut in the rock, at its southeast angle, lead up to the hill of the Areopagus from the valley of the Agora, which lies between it and the Pnyx. This angle seems to be the point of the hill on which the council of the Areopagus sat. Immediately above the steps, on the level of the hill, is a bench of stone excavated in the limestone rock, forming three sides of a quadrangle, like a triclinium: it faces the south: on its east and west side is a raised block: the former may, perhaps, have been the tribunal, the two latter the rude stones which Pausanias saw here, and which are described by Euripides as assigned, the one to the accuser, the other to the criminal, in the causes which were tried in this court.' The stone seats are intermediate in position to the sites of the Temple of Mars and the Sanctuary of the Eumenides, mentioned below."26

Also notice that even in the footnote cited above, Wordsworth credited Euripides for information about the tribunal.

Euripides → Wordsworth → Conybeare → Ellen White

[Wordsworth gave credit]

[Conybeare gave credit]

[no credit given by EGW]

²⁶ Conybeare and Howson, <u>The Life and Epistles of St. Paul</u>, p. 289, footnote #2

It appears that *Ellen White even copied parts from Conybeare's footnote* that referenced Wordsworth.

We found <u>The Life and Epistles of St. Paul</u> by Conybeare and Howson to be a very interesting and in-depth study of St. Paul's life, and is well documented. Ellen White recommended this book to her followers, so her copying may not have been intentionally deceitful by her. However, neither does it seem to have come directly to her from God in vision.

Although the Conference has tried to excuse Ellen White's copying, we find it extremely ironic that James White, publisher of the *Review and Herald*, viewed others' copying in a different light. He stated,

"We are perfectly willing that pieces from the *Review*, or any of our books should be published to any extent, and all we ask is, that simple justice be done us, by due credit being given." (*Review and Herald*, September 1864.)

Instead of encouraging students to emulate Ellen White's practice of literary borrowing, an editorial printed in the Adventist publication *Youth's Instructor* stated,

"Taking another's knowledge and parading it as one's own is a despicable thing to do. The student who copies at examination time is dishonest; but plagiarism is a meaner kind of thievery, if there are degrees of dishonesty." (*Youth's Instructor*, December 1917)

B. Prophetic predictions

We have heard from several Adventist sources that Ellen White made prophetic predictions that have come true, thus substantiating her claim to be "much more than" what the term "prophet" implies. We are not aware of *even one* Ellen White prediction that was specific and has conclusively been fulfilled. We have heard more than one lecture that proclaimed Ellen White to be a prophet, but the most complete one we have heard about the accuracy of her predictions was a video lecture by Adventist Dr. Veith.²⁷ We are not certain if Dr. Veith represents the Seventh-day Adventist General conference, but he has provided a useful service for researchers by consolidating many of the anecdotal claims of Ellen White's prophetic predictions into a concise single lecture.

We were loaned Dr. Veith's video lecture by an Adventist friend and studied it in depth to try to substantiate Dr. Veith's claims. We have included our detailed critique of that lecture. We have not included references for each individual statement made by Dr. Veith, but his statements are all enclosed in quotation marks, unless otherwise noted.

Page 5

²⁵ Ellen G. White, <u>Sketches from the Life of Paul</u> (1883), pgs. 92, 97.

²⁷ Dr. Veith, "God's Guiding Gift #22B, Testing the Prophet". Lecture on DVD format.

God's Guiding Gift (DVD Lecture #22B), by Dr. Veith

When "testing the prophet", Dr. Veith proposed seven tests that he said are supported by scripture:

- 1. "A true prophet's message must be in harmony with the word of God and the law of God. Lamentations 2:9"
- "A true prophet's predictions must come true. 2. Deut. 18:22"
- "A true prophet edifies God's people. 1 Cor. 14:
- "A true prophet exalts Christ as the Son of God. Luke 24:27"
- 5. "A true prophet speaks with authority. Matt. 7:29"
- 6. "A true prophet will bear good fruit. Matt 7:20"
- "A true prophet will exhibit definite physical signs when in vision."
 - a) "The prophets eyes are open during vision. Num. 24:4"
 - "A true prophet first falls down and has no strength, is then strengthened, but has no breath (even whilst speaking) whilst in vision. Dan. 10:7-18"

Summary of test #7:

- i. "Falls down weak"
- ii. "Is raised up and strengthened by God"
- "Has eyes wide open during iii. vision"
- iv. "Does not breathe during vision, but can speak"

Dr. Veith quoted documents to support his arguments, including "Ecclesiastical Research, p. 51" and "Centuries of Christianity a Concise History, P. 58". However, he did not list authors, publishers nor dates for these references. Nor did he explain why they are in any way authoritative.

The closest reference to the first document that we could find was A History of the English Prayer-book in Relation to the Doctrine of the Eucharist, which was only referred to in our internet search of the phrase "a work of ecclesiastical research".

For Dr. Veith's second reference, he probably meant 20 [Twenty] Centuries of Christianity, a Concise History, by Hutchinson and Garrison; Harcourt, Brace, NY 1959. He probably erred on the title when he copied that same error from "Discoveries in Prophecy lecture #19" by Mark Finley. Also, the quotation from that work that was given by Dr. Veith did not match the quote that was given by Mark Finley. So either Dr. Veith or Mark Findlay (or both) must be in error. We could not locate these references through our library resources to see if either one was accurate.

One problem we have come to notice recently is the problem of speakers and writers copying from one another and from non-original or non-scriptural sources. Hence

the conflict between Finley's and Vieth's quotations. Another example can be found in the evangelistic lectures we attended last year (March 2004), when the evangelist stated the following:

> "And so there was [sic] two sanctuaries, one on earth, and one in heaven. Now if we look at the earthly sanctuary, we can learn something about the heavenly. Just as we understand the heavenly in the light of the earthly. Now in the earthly sanctuary, every morning and evening, they made a sacrifice. And that sacrifice was for... and individuals would come and lay the sacrifice at the altar. The sacrifice would be made, the blood would be placed, and they would take the blood onto the curtain of the most holy place. And every day, morning and evening; every day the sacrifice. You see, the people of Israel could not say they had no warning about the coming of the Messiah."28

The evangelist may have copied this error from Ellen White in Patriarchs and Prophets, (p. 354) or Signs of the Times Special Report on Judgement, Pacific Press, (no date found), instead of looking it up in the Bible for himself. Here is what Ellen White wrote:

> "The most important part of the daily ministration was the service performed in behalf of *individuals*. The repentant sinner brought his offering to the door of the tabernacle, and, placing his hand upon the victim's head, confessed his sins, thus in figure transferring them from himself to the innocent sacrifice. By his own hand the animal was then slain, and the blood was carried by the priest into the holy place and sprinkled before the veil, behind which was the ark containing the law that the sinner had transgressed. By this ceremony the sin was, through the blood, transferred in figure to the sanctuary. In some cases the blood was not taken into the holy place;* but the flesh was then to be eaten by the priest, as Moses directed the sons of Aaron, saying, "God hath given it you to bear the iniquity of the congregation."²⁹ – EGW [emphasis added]

> > * See Patriarchs and Prophets Appendix, Note 6.

Perhaps the evangelist may have neglected to check endnote #6 in Patriarchs and Prophets where the editors tried to correct Mrs. White's error with a note in the Appendix.³⁰ Leviticus 4:27-35 clearly states that the blood

²⁸ "Revelation Offers Hope" Tape #15, approximately 10 minutes into the tape.

²⁹ Ellen G. White, <u>Patriarchs and Prophets</u>, Pacific Press Publishing Association, Mountain View, CA (1958), p.

³⁰ Ibid., p. 761.

from individuals' and leaders' sacrifices was <u>not</u> carried daily into the holy place.

"And the priest shall take of the blood thereof with his finger, and put it upon the horns of the altar of burnt offering, and shall pour out all the blood thereof at the bottom of the altar." Lev. 4:30 (KJV)

Did Ellen White perhaps in turn copy that error from some other previous writer? It is unlikely that she received that error in a vision from God.

We did not discuss this with the evangelist personally because we did not detect it until some time after the lecture series had ended while we were reviewing the tapes that we purchased. One possible reason for his error was that he modified his explanation of the individuals' daily blood sacrifice to better explain God's redemptive plan. Or maybe both he and Ellen White changed it to better fit the Adventist sanctuary doctrine. Maybe the earthly sanctuary model and procedures in the Bible do not fit accurately enough the heavenly sanctuary. It is a tempting analogy to incorrectly compare the individuals' daily sacrifice with Jesus' redemptive work after the cross for 1811 years; and then compare the yearly function of the high priest with Jesus' post-1844 work in the most holy place. It is unfortunate that details of a doctrine so central to Adventist beliefs were not presented with greater accuracy.

Did Ellen White also carry forward errors from authors she copied from? Did she get mixed up about the chronology of the Tower of Babel (being before the flood) from the Freemason's "Legend of Enoch" or Dr. Durham 's (Mormon) address entitled "Is There No Help For the Widow's Son?"? That legend has Enoch recording the history of the Tower on golden plates which he buried before the Flood.

According to Ellen White...

"The Lord first established the system of sacrificial offerings with Adam after his fall, which he taught to his descendants. This system was corrupted before the flood by those who separated themselves from the faithful followers of God, and engaged in the building of the tower of Babel. They sacrificed to gods of their own making instead of the God of Heaven." — EGW [emphasis added]

Later Ellen White got the Tower chronology right (after the flood, not before³²), but then she said that the builders built the Tower to "escape another flood". Did she also copy that thought from someone else?

³² The Flood is recorded in Genesis 7, the Tower of Babel in Genesis 11.

"One object before them in the erection of the tower was to secure their own safety in case of another deluge. By carrying the structure to a much greater height than was reached by the waters of the Flood, they thought to place themselves beyond all possibility of danger. And as they would be able to ascend to the region of the clouds, they hoped to ascertain the cause of the Flood. The whole undertaking was designed to exalt still further the pride of its projectors and to turn the minds of future generations away from God and lead them into idolatry."

None of those reasons given by Ellen White for the building of the Tower can be found in the Bible.

"And they said, Go to, let us build us a city and a tower, whose top *may reach* unto heaven; and let us make us a name, lest we be scattered abroad upon the face of the whole earth." – Genesis 11:4 (KJV)

In his lecture, Dr. Veith explained where the gift of prophesy would be found:

- "The Bible predicts the gift of prophesy will be restored to God's church in the last days. 1 Cor 1:6,7"
- "God's last day church would keep His commandments and have the gift of prophesy." (emphasis mine)
- "In the 1840's a group of Advent believers believed Christ would come. When He didn't they were deeply disappointed."

"...and [then they] studied the scriptures. The Bible also said that those who study the Word, who believe the Word, and wait for the coming of the Lord, and who keep God's Word... that they will be coming behind in no gift, which must include that gift [of prophesy]." – Dr. Veith.

<u>Dr. Veith asked, "Did she [Ellen White] fulfill [the]criteria of a prophet?"</u>

Dr. Veith devoted his entire lecture to "proving" Ellen White was a true prophet by testing her. Alternately, we learned from another Adventist pastor that you should not test the prophets—because God will do what He is going to do.³⁴

Dr. Veith asked, "Did she [Ellen White] exalt the Word of God?" Dr. Veith referenced some of her writings to support this. (Selected Messages Vol. 2, p. 48; Vol. 1, p. 18; Vol. 1, p. 416). He then quoted her as follows:

³¹Ellen White, <u>Spiritual Gifts</u>, vol. 3, p. 301.

³³ Ellen White, <u>Patriarchs and Prophets</u>, p. 119.

³⁴ Sabbath sermon, Prescott, AZ, Camp meeting, June 19, 2004.

"Cannot men see that to belittle the law of God is dishonoring Christ? Why did He come to the world to suffer and die, if the law is not binding upon human beings?"³⁵ - EGW

Ellen White did <u>not</u> fulfill Dr. Veith's criteria. She said the "greatest commandment" was the Fourth Commandment (keeping the Sabbath).

"The pope has changed the day of rest from the seventh to the first day. He has thought to change the very commandment that was given to cause man to remember his Creator. He has thought to change the *greatest commandment* in the decalogue and thus make himself equal with God, or even exalt himself above God." - EGW³⁶ [emphasis added]

"They trace down the lively oracles, but start back with trembling when they see the fourth commandment among the ten holy precepts, with a brighter light shining upon it than upon the other nine, and a halo of glory all around it". - EGW³⁷

Ellen White did not start keeping that "Greatest Commandment" until two years after her first visions. Even then, she did not correctly keep it for another seven years (6 pm to 6 pm instead of sundown to sundown). She even contradicted our Savior, Jesus Christ, who said that the *greatest commandment* was to "Love the Lord your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your mind. This is the first and greatest commandment." (Matt 22:37-38). Nowhere can it be found during Jesus' earthly ministry that He ever admonished us to keep His so-called "greatest" Sabbath commandment.

Dr. Veith made it very clear that true prophets are those that keep His Word and Commandments. Ellen White's early visions and prophesies must have been false if she was not keeping the fourth and, according to her, the greatest Commandment. The Bible says if we're guilty of one then we're guilty of them all!³⁸ She claimed to have had those early visions, but all the while she was breaking His Fourth Commandment.

<u>Dr. Veith asked, "[Did her] predictions come</u> true?"

"She made so many, one wouldn't know where to start. San Fransisco earthquake, April 18, 1906 was predicted exactly. She said, 'people get out, the

Lord is going to flatten that city'." – Dr. Veith.

She did <u>not</u> fulfill the criteria in regard to the San Francisco earthquake. First, she did not predict it until she wrote it out weeks after the fact when she supposedly "remembered" that she had had a vision about it. All of the Bible prophets that we are familiar with predicted things before they happened, not after. Even Ellen White herself later denied that she predicted that earthquake:

"Since the San Francisco earthquake, many rumors have been current regarding statements I have made. Some have reported that while in Los Angeles, I claimed that I had predicted the San Francisco earthquake and fire, and that Los Angeles would be the next city to suffer. This is not true. The morning after the earthquake, I said no more than that 'the earthquakes will come; the floods will come;' and that the Lord's message to us is that we shall 'not establish ourselves in the wicked cities." - EGW

Dr. Veith's statement that she predicted it "exactly" is certainly an exaggeration of the facts!—even according to Ellen White herself! Anyone could have predicted that an earthquake would occur *sometime* in California. Several were already recorded during or just prior to and during Ellen White's lifetime and before her 1906 "prediction":

1769, July 28: First historical California earthquake.

1812, Dec 8: 40 people killed in California. 1812, Dec 21: Tsunami washed over Santa Barbara.

1836, June 10: The Hayward Valley, CA Earthquake.

1838, June: Ground ruptured on the SF Peninsula.

1852, Nov 22: Lake Merced, CA abruptly sank 30 feet.

1857, Jan 9: Fort Tejon, CA Earthquake. LA river changed course.

1865, Oct 8: Mark Twain witnessed this quake in SF.

1868, Oct 21: 30 people killed in California. 1869, Aug 9: Pope Pius IX sets a day for prayer for earthquake protection.

1872, Mar 26: 7 people killed in California. A seven foot fault scarp appears.

1872, Apr 3: Large aftershock.

1872, Apr 11: Large aftershock.

1899, Dec 25: 6 people killed in California.

Predicting earthquakes in California would have been like predicting hurricanes in Florida, tornados in Kansas, or sandstorms in the Sahara Desert!

³⁵ Dr. Veith did not give a reference for this Ellen White quotation, but it was probably from *Signs of the Times*, "An Unchangable Law", Jan 25, 1905. Dr. Veith's wording varied slightly from the original.

³⁶ Ellen White, <u>Early Writings</u>, (1882), p.65.

³⁷ Ibid., p. 255.

³⁸ James 2:10.

³⁹ Ellen White, <u>Life Sketches</u>, p. 411.

While on the subject of earthquakes, Ellen White made another claim about earthquakes. She stated that the tragic Lisbon, Portugal earthquake of 1755 was *the most terrible* earthquake that has ever been recorded⁴⁰ and that it supposedly heralded the soon coming of Christ. During that earthquake 70,000 died. However history contradicts Ellen White as to that one being the most terrible:

~856 (A.D.): Damghan, Iran. 200,000 died ~893 (A.D.): Ardabil, Iran. 150,000 died

1138: Aleppo, Syria. 230,000 died

1290: Chihli, China. 100,000 died

1556: Shansi, China. 830,000 died

1667: Shemakha, Caucasia. 80,000 died

1727: Tabriz, Iran. 77,000 died

The recent December 26, 2004 Indonesian earthquake and resulting tsunami is purported to have killed about 200,000. The Lisbon earthquake pales in comparison as a herald to Christ's return.

<u>Dr. Veith: "Wars and secret societies"</u>. You don't need to be a prophet to predict that. All you have to do is copy what the Bible says about wars and secret societies to be on safe ground on those topics! (Matt 24:6 and James 5:12)

<u>Dr. Veith: "Monopolies".</u> It's possible that she was accurate about this one. We will need to brush up on our history of American industry and the economy in order to support or deny the accuracy of her predictions about the power and evils of monopolies. Unfortunately, Dr. Veith did not reference any specific predictions she made, or how they were fulfilled — just generalities.

Dr. Veith: "Trade Unions". Ellen predicted the dangers of trade unions in 4 Manuscript Releases 75.1 (1903), according to Dr. Veith. He said that she was ahead of her time on this "prediction". However, no "voice of God" is needed to warn against this! There had been labor union troubles in the United States for 250 years before Ellen White ever wrote her "prediction". Strikes, violence, criminal activity, executions, and all sorts of unsavory trade union activities occurred prior to and during Ellen White's time. Unions became even more powerful and violent in the years following the Civil War and up to the time of her writing in 1903. Surely, this is no test of a "prophet"! (See our Appendix I, "Labor History Timeline")

Dr. Veith: "Fires in New York City". Dr. Veigh showed a slide of the World Trade Center on fire and read Ellen's "prediction" from "Life Sketches" 413.4, Feb 15, 1904. He did not directly say that Ellen predicted the WTC tragedy; probably because even the General Conference's White Estate, Incorporated has denied that. However, predicting devastating

⁴⁰ Ellen G. White, <u>The Great Controversy</u>, (1911), p. 304

fires in large cities take no special "gift" – just a look at history. On Dec 16-17, 1835 a fire in NYC destroyed 674 buildings; on Feb 2, 1860 the Elm Street tenement fire killed 200 people; on Feb 7, 1904 (eight days before Ellen's writing) the Great Fire of Baltimore destroyed 1,343 buildings in nearby Maryland! Anyone with even a limited knowledge of U.S. history could (and can) accurately predict that there will continue to be devastating urban fires in the future.

<u>Dr. Veith: "Tobacco".</u> Dr. Veith thought Ellen's warnings about the dangers of tobacco were "way ahead of her time". In 1864 she wrote about those dangers in *Councils on Health* pg. 84. Dr. Veith intimated that tobacco was considered "medicinal", not harmful, until only recently. He said:

"Not until 1957 did a committee of scientists appointed by the American Cancer Society and the American Heart Association conclude that smoking was a causative factor in lung cancer." – Dr. Veith.

Ellen White must have been more aware of the history of tobacco than Dr. Veith when she wrote her predictions. All she had to do is repeat what many others before her had stated. Here are some of the proclamations about tobacco⁴¹ that were made prior to Ellen White receiving a vision and writing about it.

- 1578: Catholic Church passes a law against smoking in any place of worship in the Spanish Colonies.
- 1586: "De plantis epitome utilissima" (German) cautions the use of tobacco, calling it a "violent herb".
- 1604: King James I writes "A Counterblaste to Tobacco".
- 1610: Sir Francis Bacon writes that tobacco use is... a custom hard to quit.
- 1617: Dr. Wm Vaughn writes that tobacco is an "outlandish weede; spends the braine and spoiles the seede; dims the sight".
- 1621: Tobias Venner publishes a work condemning tobacco's use for pleasure.
- 1632: Massachusetts forbids public smoking.
- 1638: In China tobacco use is punishable by death.
- 1701: Nicholas Andryde Boisregard warns of "trembling, unsteady hands, staggering feet and suffer a withering of "their noble parts."
- 1761: John Hill performs perhaps the first clinical study of tobacco effects, warns snuff users they are vulnerable to cancers of the nose.
- 1795: Sammuel Thomas von Soemmering of Maine reports on cancers of the lip in pipe smokers.
- 1798: Benjamin Rush warns of medical dangers of tobacco and that it leads to drunkenness.

http://www.tobaccolorg/resources/history/ tobacco history.html

- 1828: Reimann and Heinrich (University of Heidelberg) conclude tobacco is a "dangerous poison".
- 1830s: First organized anti-tobacco movement begins
- 1836: Samuel Green writes in the *New England* Almanac and Farmers' Friend that tobacco is an insecticide, a poison, a filthy habit, and can kill a man.
- 1859: Reverend George Trask publishes tract "Thoughts and Stories for American Lads" warning about tobacco and that thousands are killed each year because of it.
- 1864: Ellen White finally writes about the dangers of tobacco.

No informed person of Ellen White's time would think tobacco to be healthful. Dr. Veith's use of her condemnation of tobacco as proof of a prophetic gift certainly seems unsubstantiated by the facts.

Dr. Veith said that a test of a prophet is that their predictions come true. He discussed just a few of the supposedly "many" that she made. Probably some did come true (for example that people would someday discount her prophesies). But so did the predictions of other supposed prophets. Joseph Smith correctly prophesied the Civil War and even correctly prophesied where it would begin (in South Carolina). And the only thanks he received was to be martyred in 1844 by an angry mob, the same year as the Second Adventist Great Disappointment! Nostradamous, Jean Dixon, and the other false prophets mentioned by Dr. Veith all got at least a few of their many predictions correct.

> Dr. Veith: "Edify the church?" Dr. Veith proposes that the Adventist health and charity ministries fulfill this requirement of a prophet. However, the Roman Catholic Church, Mormons and many other organizations have ministries that would fulfill this requirement also.

Dr. Veith: "Physical signs? Dr. Veith stated that physical signs during vision are a test of a true prophet. However, nowhere in the scripture can we find this test. Dr. Veith quotes several examples (Daniel, etc.) where some of the characteristics of Ellen's swooning match the biblical record. However, there is no record of swooning for many of the biblical prophets. Swooning does not discount a prophet, but certainly it is not a test of a true prophet, as Dr. Veith suggested.

Jesus, the greatest prophet, learned of His mission early in life and even discussed Scripture in the temple as a child. There is no record that He had "physical signs" different than that of other children. Isaiah predicted that He would..."grow up before Him as a tender plant, and as a root out of a dry ground: He hath no form or comeliness; and when we shall see Him, there is no beauty that we should desire Him." Isaiah 53:2. According to Ellen White, Jesus' older brothers (hopefully half-brothers, if

they were indeed older), sided with the rabbis against Jesus.

> "All this displeased His brothers. Being older than Jesus, they felt that He should be under their dictation. His brothers, as the sons of Joseph were called, sided with the rabbis. They insisted that the traditions must be heeded, as if they were the requirements of God."42 - EGW

If He truly had "older" brothers (non-biblical), wouldn't they as young men perhaps have been convinced of His teachings if He had indeed displayed physical signs? There is no mention of John the Baptist having any physical signs either, or hardly any of the other New or Old Testament prophets, that we could find. Paul himself was convinced of God's presence when he was struck down, but that was not proof to others of his vision being

Dr. Veith made the claim that Ellen White had the distinction of being the most prolific female author in American history. We are not sure why Dr. Veith mentioned that she was a prolific writer unless to somehow bolster his claim that she had some special gift from God because she was able to write so much. This would be a difficult claim to prove. Many of her writings were repeated over and over again in different publications. Much of her work was copied from others, usually without credit, but published under her name. She had a staff of writers and copyists that contributed much that was published under her name. It has been claimed by critics (but personally unsubstantiated by us) that entire chapters of her conflict series were written by others.

C. Spiritualism

Ellen White both explained and predicted the future of spiritualism. She wrote about two young sisters, the famous Katherine and Margaret Fox from Rochester, NY, that claimed to hear inexplicable rapping sounds emanating from their house.

> "The mysterious rapping with which modern spiritualism began was not the result of human trickery or cunning, but was the direct work of evil angels, who thus introduced one of the most successful of soul-destroying delusions." - EGW^{43} [emphasis added]

She even had a vision and wrote a prophesy about it.

"I saw that soon it would be considered blasphemy to speak against the rapping, and that it would spread more and more, that Satan's power would increase and some of his devoted followers would have power to work miracles and even to bring down fire from heaven in the sight of men." - EGW⁴⁴

⁴² Ellen White, <u>Desire of Ages</u>, p.86,87.

⁴³ Ellen White, <u>The Great Controversy</u>, p. 553.

⁴⁴ Ellen White, Early Writings, p. 59.

We find it inexplicable why Mrs. White thought that it would be "blasphemy" to specifically speak against rapping. Later, one of the Fox girls *confessed that it was just a trick* and explained to everyone how it was done. Here is her published confession:

"My sister Katie was the first one to discover that by swishing her fingers she could produce a certain noise with the knuckles and joints, and that the same effect could be made with the toes. Finding we could make raps with our feet - first with one foot and then with both- we practiced until we could do this easily when the room was dark. No one suspected us of any trick because we were such young children ... all the neighbors thought there was something, and they wanted to find out what it was. They were convinced some one had been murdered in the house. They asked us about it, and we would rap one for the spirit answer "yes", not three, as we did afterwards. We did not know anything about Spiritualism then. The murder, they concluded, must have been committed in the house. They went over the whole surrounding country, trying to get the names of people who had formerly lived in the house. They found finally a man by the name of Bell, and they said that this poor innocent man had committed a murder in the house, and that these noises came from the spirit of the murdered person. Poor Bell was shunned and looked upon by the whole community as a murderer. As far as spirits were concerned, neither my sister nor I thought about it...I have seen so much miserable deception that I am willing to assist in any way and to positively state that Spiritualism is a fraud of the worst description. I do so before my God, and my idea is to expose it... I trust that this statement, coming solemnly from me, the first and most successful in this deception, will break the force of the rapid growth of Spiritualism and prove that it is all a fraud, a hypocrisy and a *delusion*." – Margaret Fox⁴⁵ [emphasis added]

After Margaret's confession, "rappings" did not "spread more and more" as Ellen had prophesied. The "rapping" phenomena flourished for a while in the late 1800's with the famous Davenport Brothers and others, but then pretty much died out after their tricks were exposed. But Ellen stuck to her story anyway. By her flambouyant warnings that the rappings had supernatural satanic origins, many of her followers were probably awed and frightened into an even stronger belief in her false claims of divine inspiration.

Unlike Ellen White, many reputable, ethical, responsible, and professional magicians and conjurers have spoken out against and performed a public service by exposing these

and other so-called spiritualists. They were able to expose them even without claiming divine inspiration. Contrary to Ellen White's teachings, they have proven that this socalled paranormal activity is only human trickery and cunning, nothing more. No supernatural assistance is needed to pull a rabbit from a hat, bend a spoon, or tell someone something they want to hear from "beyond" this life. Yet we have heard at least three Adventist preachers. including a local evangelist and Dr. Veith, attest to witnessing such events and crediting supernatural powers. In his lecture we heard Dr. Veith speak of shoes walking by themselves, walking canes moving on their own, dishes flying across the room. The evangelist claimed to have witnessed some of those exact same things. We have been in some pretty evil places in our day, and seen some evil events, but we have never witnessed anything like that, except maybe at Disneyland's Haunted House theme park attraction.

It is interesting that the famous escapist Harry Houdini learned some of his tricks by exposing these frauds. He learned how they could free their hands after being bound and cuffed to still perform their "rappings". He then used this knowledge and his skill to perfect his famous escape routines to delight audiences for decades with his (non-supernatural) slight-of-hand illusions and intriguing escape routines.

In her prediction quoted above, Mrs. White prophesied that *through Satan's power*, his followers would miraculously "bring down fire from heaven in the sight of men". Despite the power Ellen White attributed to Satan in her terrifying unfulfilled prediction, Satan did not or could not assist some four hundred fifty of Baal's prophets to bring down even enough fire to light their own heathen sacrifice as related in I Kings 18. Just one small ember or match would probably have sufficed to ignite their dry firewood. As written in Matthew 24:24, Christ warned us not to be *deceived* by these *false* miracle-workers.

D. Miller's prophetic time calculations

Ellen White claimed that Miller's erroneous date calculations were inspired of God.

"I [Ellen White] saw that *God was in the proclamation* of the time in 1843. It was His design to arouse the people and bring them to a testing point, where they should decide for or against the *truth*. Thousands were led to embrace the *truth* preached by William Miller." ⁴⁶ - EGW [emphasis added]

She condemned as the work of Satan those who <u>correctly</u> claimed that Miller was in error.

⁴⁵ "New York World Newspaper", Oct. 21, 1888

⁴⁶ Ellen G. White, <u>Early Writings</u>, p. 232.

"They [those who would not receive Miller's message] realized not that they were rejecting the counsel of God against themselves, and that they were *working in union with Satan* and his angels to perplex God's people, who were living out the *heaven-born message*." ⁴⁷ - EGW [emphasis added]

"They [those who would not receive Miller's message] mocked and scoffed, and everywhere was heard, *No man knoweth the day and the hour.*" ⁴⁸ - EGW [see Matt. 24:36; Mark 13:32]

"Many ministers would not accept this saving message themselves, and those who would receive it, they hindered. The blood of souls is *upon them*. Preachers and people joined to oppose this message from heaven. They persecuted Wm. Miller, and those who united with him in the work. Falsehoods were circulated to injure his influence, and at different times after he had plainly declared the counsel of God, applying cutting truths to the hearts of his hearers, great rage was kindled against him, and as he left the place of meeting, some way-laid him in order to take his life. But angels of God were sent to preserve his life, and they led him safely away from the angry mob. His work was not yet finished."⁴⁹ – EGW [emphasis added]

Ellen White said of William Miller,

"[He] possessed strong mental powers, disciplined by thought and study; and he added to these the wisdom of heaven by connecting himself with the Source of wisdom." "Without passion or excitement he tested all theories and doctrines by the Word of God, and his sound reasoning and thorough knowledge of the Scriptures enabled him to refute error and expose falsehood." - EGW⁵⁰

Not only was Miller's "heaven-born" message <u>incorrect</u> as to the supposed date (1843 vs. 1844) but as to the event as well (Christ's return to earth vs. purported Investigative Judgement). In other words, <u>those who rejected Miller's prediction were in league with Satan but they knew the truth</u> as found in Scripture. In contrast, <u>those that accepted Miller's message with God's supposed help were proclaimed to be in error</u>.

Miller's prophesy chart and lectures are reported to have contained fifteen calculations that pointed to 1843 as the date of Christ's return. Some of these can be found on Miller's chart titled "God's Everlasting Kingdom" that featured the statue in Nebuchadnezzar's dream and symbols of the various beasts.



When Christ failed to return in 1843, the devoted Millerites corrected the date to 1844. We have heard from Adventists that the error was that Miller overlooked the fact that there was no year zero. But if he was "disciplined by thought and study" he would have been aware of this well-known fact. (2 BC \rightarrow 1 BC \rightarrow 1 AD \rightarrow 2 AD; no vear zero.) Furthermore, some of his calculations did not cross year zero, so correcting the year zero problem would not fix his 1843 error. The only calculation that Adventists now preach is #7 which subtracts 490 from 33 A.D. to arrive at 457 B.C. Then adding 2300 to 457 B.C (2300 – 457) brings you to 1843. By correcting the year zero error you now have to start at 458 B.C. When you then add 2300 (again skipping year zero) you still end up back at 1843! This has to be fixed by also correcting another of Miller's error—that of the date of Christ's death.

EGW blamed the mistake on God, but never revealed exactly what the mistake was.

"The Lord showed me that the *1843 chart was directed by His hand*, and that no part of it should be altered; that the figures were as He wanted them. That His hand was over and hid a mistake in some of the figures, so that none could see it, until His hand was removed." - EGW⁵¹ [emphasis added]

⁴⁷ Ellen G. White, <u>Spiritual Gifts</u>, Vol. 1. p. 139.

⁴⁸ Ibid, p. 142.

⁴⁹ Ibid, p. 136

⁵⁰ Ellen G. White, <u>The Great Controversy</u> (1911), p. 335.

⁵¹ Ellen G. White, *Review and Herald*, Nov. 1850.

Ellen White even taught that the acceptance of Miller's (erroneous) message was necessary for salvation.

> "Ministers who would not accept this saving message themselves hindered those who would have received it. The blood of souls is upon them." - EGW⁵² [emphasis added]

We have prepared a brief summary of Miller's fifteen calculations. Many writers have studied them in detail. explained them and commented on them.⁵³ The sources and justifications for many of the numbers are vague, nonexistent, or historically in error. It is easy to see why fourteen of these "heaven-borne" calculations are no longer taught by Adventists. The only date calculation we have heard preached is #7, and that has been altered and based on several assumptions. It is especially disturbing that Miller even used '666' in a calculation that was to herald Jesus' glorious return.

See Appendix II, "Summary of Miller's 15 Predictions for Christ's Return to Earth"

E. Amalgamation

Ellen White said that one of the sins that resulted in the Flood was that of amalgamation of man and beast.

> "But if there was one sin above another which called for the destruction of the race by the flood, it was the base crime of amalgamation of man and beast which defaced the image of God, and caused confusion everywhere"54 - EGW

> "Every species of animal which God had created, were preserved in the ark. The confused species which God did not create, which were the result of amalgamation, were destroyed by the flood. Since the flood there has been amalgamation of man and beast, as may be seen in the endless varieties of species of animals and certain races of men."55 - EGW

In the Biblical account of the Flood in Genesis 7, there is no mention of any species, confused or not, being left off the ark.

Where are the races of men today that Mrs. White referred to? Apologists claim that by "amalgamation" she meant a

⁵⁵ Ibid., p. 75.

confusion of animal species and confusion between righteous and unrighteous humans – not between animals and man. 56 However, Uriah Smith clarified that she did indeed mean the intermingling between man and animals and even mentioned those races by name.

> "...the wild Bushmen of Africa, some tribes of the Hottentots, and perhaps the Digger Indians of our own country, &c.. Moreover, naturalists affirm that the line of demarcation between the human and animal races is lost in confusion. It is impossible, as they affirm, to tell just where the human ends and the animal begins." "Whatever race of men we may take, Bushmen, Hottentots, Patagonians, or any class of people, however low they may apparently be in the scale of humanity, their mental capabilities are in every instance the basis on which we are to work, and by which we determine whether they are subjects of moral government or not."⁵⁷ – Uriah Smith

Uriah Smith was an early Adventist leader as well as a contemporary, friend and close companion of Ellen White. Uriah Smith makes it clear by his statements that "amalgamated" peoples cannot even be saved, just as the amalgamated creatures were left off the ark. It appears that Ellen White must have agreed with Mr. Smith's explanation since she helped distribute copies of his book.58

No reasonable person today holds to the belief that there exist sub-human or amalgamated races of men.

Sabbath

Adventists and Ellen White teach that the Sabbath is a sign of God's true remnant people and that those who are not keeping the Sabbath, but Sunday instead, are apostate and in danger of receiving the mark of the beast. In fact, Sunday worship is purported to **be** that mark. Adventists teach that keeping Sunday, instead of the Sabbath, will be that identifying mark.

> "Here the Sabbath is clearly designated as a sign between God and His people. The mark of the beast is the opposite—the observance of the first day of the week."⁵⁹ - EGW

The Adventist Fundamental Belief #18 states, "These precepts [the Ten Commandments] are the basis of God's covenant with His people and the standard in God's

⁵² Ellen G. White, Early Writings, p. 234 ⁵³ For examples of the many commentaries of Miller's 1843 calculations, see: www.ex-da.com/dowling.htm; www.truthorfables.com/Miller%27s Time%20

Proved 15 Ways.htm; or <u>Cultic Doctrine of Seventh-day</u> Adventists by Dale Ratzlaff.

⁵⁴ Ellen G. White, Spiritual Gifts, Vol. 3., p. 64.

⁵⁶ See Ellen G. White and Her Critics, pgs. 306-322.

⁵⁷ The Visions of Mrs. E. G. White, A Manifestation of Spiritual Gifts According to the Scriptures, Uriah Smith (1868), "Objection 39", pgs. 102-105.

^{58 &}quot;James and Ellen White took 2,000 copies of Smith's book with them to camp meetings that year." Spectrum, June 12, 1982, p. 14.

⁵⁹ Ellen G. White, <u>Testimonies for the Church</u>, Vol. 8, p. 117.

judgment." Belief #19 states, "The Sabbath is God's perpetual sign of His eternal covenant between Him and His people."

However, we believe through His Word that God teaches otherwise.

We believe that the Ten Commandments, including keeping the Sabbath day, was not binding on anyone before the exodus from Egypt and therefore is not a sign of His *eternal* covenant. There is no reference to the Sabbath or Sabbath keeping before the Ten Commandments were given as recorded in Exodus 20. The "seventh day" is referenced in the creation story, but only that *God* rested—not man. Nowhere can we find that a command was given to Adam, Noah, or Abraham to keep the seventh day any differently than the other days.

"The Lord our God made a covenant with us in Horeb. The Lord made *not* this covenant with our fathers, but with us, even us, who are all of us here alive this day." Deut. 5: 2,3.

The Sabbath was given to commemorate the exodus from Egypt, as written in this reminder from Moses:

"And remember that thou wast a servant in the land of Egypt, and that the Lord thy God brought thee out thence through a mighty hand and by a stretched out arm: *therefore* the Lord thy God commanded thee to keep the Sabbath day." Deut. 5:15.

The prophet Jeremiah said that God promised a <u>new</u> covenant with His people to <u>replace</u> the one given at Sinai. This promise was reiterated by Paul.

"Behold, the days come, saith the Lord, that I will make a *new* covenant with the house of Israel, and with the house of Judah: *Not* according to the covenant that I made with their fathers in the day that I took them by the hand to bring them out of the land of Egypt;..." (Jer. 31:31,32)

"For finding fault with them, He saith, Behold, the days come, saith the Lord, when I will make a *new* covenant with the house of Israel and with the house of Judah: *Not* according to the covenant that I made with their fathers in the day when I took them by the hand to lead them out of the land of Egypt; because they continued not in My covenant, and I regarded them not, saith the Lord." Heb. 8: 8,9

Paul clearly explained that His people now have a new covenant, allegorically told in his letter to the churches of Galatia in the following verses:

Galatians 4:21—5:1

Tell me, ye that desire to be under the law, do ye not hear the law?

For it is written, that Abraham had two sons, the one by a bondmaid, the other by a freewoman. But he who was of the bondwoman was born after the flesh; but he of the freewoman was by promise.

Which things are an allegory: for these are the *two covenants; the one from the mount Sinai* which gendereth to bondage, which is Agar [or Hagar].

For this Agar is mount Sinai in Arabia, and answereth to Jerusalem which now is, and is in bondage with her children.

But Jerusalem which is above is free, which is the mother of us all.

For it is written, Rejoice, thou barren that bearest not; break forth and cry, thou that travailest not; for the desolate hath many more children than she which hath an husband.

Now we, brethren, as Isaac was, are the children of promise.

But as then he that was born after the flesh persecuted him that was born after the Spirit, even so it is now

Nevertheless what saith the scripture: Cast out the bondwoman and her son: for the son of the bondwoman shall not be heir with the son of the freewoman.

So then, brethren, we are not children of the bondwoman, but of the free.

5:1 Stand fast therefore in the liberty wherewith Christ hath made us free, and *be not entangled again with the yoke of bondage*.

Through His death on the cross, Jesus has given us a new covenant and we are wrapped in His cloak of righteousness. We have considered the following verses in their context and how they relate to the Law and the Sabbath:

"How much more shall the blood of Christ, who through the eternal Spirit offered himself without spot to God, purge your conscience from dead works to serve the living God?" Heb. 9:14

"And, behold, a certain lawyer stood up, and tempted him, saying, Master, what shall I do to inherit eternal life? He said unto him, What is written in the law? how readest thou? And He answering said, Thou shalt love the Lord thy God with all thy heart, and with all thy soul, and with all thy strength, and with all thy mind; and thy neighbour as thyself. And He said unto him, Thou hast answered right: this do, and thou shalt live." Luke 10:25-28

"For if Jesus had given them rest, then would He not afterward have spoken of another day. There remaineth therefore a rest to the people of God.

For he that is entered into His rest, he also hath ceased from his own works, as God did from His." Hebrews 4:8,9,10 [Please note that there is no question mark after the first sentence.]

"Owe no man any thing, but to love one another: for he that loveth another hath fulfilled the law. For this, Thou shalt not commit adultery, Thou shalt not kill, Thou shalt not steal, Thou shalt not bear false witness. Thou shalt not covet: and if there be any other commandment, it is briefly comprehended in this saying, namely, Thou shalt love thy neighbour as thyself. Love worketh no ill to his neighbour: therefore love is the fulfilling of the law." Rom. 13:8-10

"For, brethren, ye have been called unto liberty; only use not liberty for an occasion to the flesh, but by love serve one another. For all the law is fulfilled in one word, even in this; Thou shalt love thy neighbour as thyself." Gal. 5:13

"If ye fulfil the royal law according to the scripture, Thou shalt love thy neighbour as thyself, ye do well:" James 2:8

"Moreover, brethren, I declare unto you the gospel which I preached unto you, which also ye have received, and wherein ye stand; By which also ye are saved, if ye keep in memory what I preached unto you, unless ye have believed in vain. For I delivered unto you first of all that which I also received, how that Christ died for our sins according to the scriptures; And that He was buried, and that He rose again the third day according to the scriptures: And that He was seen of Cephas, then of the twelve: After that, He was seen of above five hundred brethren at once; of whom the greater part remain unto this present, but some are fallen asleep." 1 Cor. 15: 1-6

"Let no man therefore judge you in meat, or in drink, or in respect of an holyday [yearly], or of the new moon [monthly], or of the sabbath days [weekly]: Which are a shadow of things to come; but the body is of Christ." Col. 2:16-17

"And He took bread, and gave thanks, and brake it, and gave unto them, saying, This is my body which is given for you: this do in remembrance of me." Luke 22:19

Ellen White wrote that keeping the Sabbath was a way of salvation.

> "It means eternal salvation to keep the Sabbath holy unto the Lord."60 - EGW

She admonished us to "jealously guard the edges of the Sabbath"⁶¹. According to Ellen White, therefore, the Pharisees of Jesus' time should have easily earned their salvation. None were more diligent in guarding every aspect of Sabbath keeping than the Pharisees.

Jesus taught that the way of salvation was through Him, not of our own works or righteousness. Even before Christ's ministry on earth, the prophet Isaiah taught us that same thing.

> "But we are all as an unclean thing, and all our righteousnesses are as filthy rags; and we all do fade as a leaf; and our iniquities, like the wind, have taken us away." Isa. 64:6

St. Paul gave us this stern warning:

"I marvel that ye are so soon removed from Him that called you into the grace of Christ unto another gospel: Which is not another; but there be some that trouble you, and would pervert the gospel of Christ. But though we, or an angel from heaven, preach any other gospel unto you than that which we have preached unto you, let him be accursed." Gal 1:6-8

Cleansing of the Heavenly Sanctuary and Investigative Judgment

Much has been written, both in support and denial, about the controversial SDA doctrine of the cleansing of the sanctuary and Investigative Judgment. During the autumn of 2004 we completed a 13-week class that was focused on this subject but we still do not fully understand the complicated SDA position on the subject. We will not attempt herein to discuss the doctrine itself, but will relate instead some general observations and conclusions we have made.

Adventists are well aware that the heavenly sanctuary doctrine of the SDA that originated after the 3rd disappointment of October 1844. After Miller's 1843/1844 predictions of Christ's return failed to occur, Mr. Hiram Edson, a Millerite, saw in his mind's eye Christ entering the Most Holy of the heavenly sanctuary to perform a pre-advent ministry. Later, others studying and relying on scripture further expanded on Edson's original epiphany⁶² to become the doctrine it is today. Ellen White, through visions from God, later confirmed its authenticity.

We have several problems with the doctrine that we summarize as follows:

1. As far as we know, all the other predictive prophesies given by God to man have resulted in events that can be witnessed by man. The

⁶⁰ Ellen G. White, Testimonies for the Church, Vol. 6, (1901), p. 356.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² The meaning of *epiphany*: "A sudden manifestation or perception of the essential nature or meaning of something."

- cleansing of the heavenly sanctuary and Investigative Judgment are supposedly taking place where no one (except supposedly Ellen White) has or can witness them.
- 2. Several assumptions are necessary to complete the story of the cleansing of the heavenly sanctuary and investigative judgment. It all hinges on a questionable interpretation of Daniel's time settings and symbolism and the symbolism in Revelation.
- 3. Ellen White has said that an understanding of this doctrine is essential and that those sinners that do not seek Jesus in His new role in heaven, are lost. However we have faith that our Lord and Savior Jesus would have made such an important event perfectly clear to us during His earthy ministry, if our salvation indeed depended on it.

"The excitements and false reformations of this day do not move us, for we know that the Master of the house rose up in 1844 and shut the door of the first apartment of the heavenly tabernacle; and now we certainly expect that they will go with their flocks to seek the Lord; but they shall not find Him; He hath withdrawn himself from them.

The Lord has shown me that the power that is with them is a mere human influence, and not the power of God." 63

– EGW [emphasis added]

4. Just like Joseph Smith, Ellen White said that the religious reformations of the mid nineteenth century were false and that those that did not accept the Adventist doctrine of Jesus' new role were lost.

"I saw that the mysterious signs and wonders, and false reformations would increase, and spread. The reformations that were shown me, were not reformations from error to truth; but from bad to worse; for those who professed a change of heart, had only wrapt about them a religious garb, which covered up the iniquity of a wicked heart. Some appeared to have been really converted, so as to deceive God's people; but if their hearts could be seen, they would appear as black as ever.

My accompanying angel bade me look for the travail of soul for sinners as used to be. I looked, but could not see it; for *the time for their salvation is past*." - EGW [emphasis added]

Critics of Ellen White have researched early Adventist history and written much about this "shut door" doctrine. Their view is that soon after the disappointment of October 1844 the Millerite group, of which Ellen White was a part, believed that there would be no new converts and that their small group were the last remaining Christians ever. When Christ did not soon appear as expected, accommodation was made by God for the children of Advent believers. Then realizing that their numbers needed to grow, more converts were allowed. Finally the doctrine was modified so that anyone could enter; but once the "saving" message was heard, then to leave was certain damnation. See how Ellen White herself and the White Estate editors have later tried to explain away Ellen White's original heretical statements from 1849 (the editor's additions are in capitalized letters and include the last two paragraphs that are enclosed in brackets, copied exactly from the White Estate website).

"I saw that the mysterious signs and wonders and false reformations would increase and spread. The reformations that were shown me were not reformations from error to truth. My accompanying angel bade me look for the travail of soul for sinners as used to be. I looked, but could not see it; for *the time for their salvation is past*. [THE WRITER OF THESE WORDS DID NOT UNDERSTAND THEM AS TEACHING THAT THE TIME FOR THE SALVATION OF ALL SINNERS WAS PAST. AT THE VERY TIME WHEN THESE THINGS WERE WRITTEN SHE HERSELF WAS LABORING FOR THE SALVATION OF SINNERS, AS SHE HAS BEEN DOING EVER SINCE.

HER UNDERSTANDING OF THE MATTER AS IT HAS BEEN PRESENTED TO HER IS GIVEN IN THE FOLLOWING PARAGRAPHS, THE FIRST PUBLISHED IN 1854, AND THE SECOND IN 1888:

"The 'false reformations' here referred to are yet to be more fully seen. The view relates more particularly to those who have heard and rejected the light of the advent doctrine. They are given over to strong delusions. Such will not have 'the travail of soul for sinners' as formerly. Having rejected the advent, and being given over to the delusions of Satan, 'the time for their salvation is past.' This does not, however, relate to those who have not heard and rejected the doctrine of the second advent."

"It is a fearful thing to treat lightly the truth which has convinced our understanding and touched our hearts. We cannot with impunity reject the warnings which God in mercy sends us. A message was sent from heaven to the world in Noah's day, and the salvation of men depended upon the manner in which they treated that message. Because they rejected the warning, the Spirit of God was withdrawn from the sinful race,

Ellen G. White, *Present Truth*, March, 1850, p. 64.
 Ellen G. White, *Review and Herald*, August 1, 1849, par. 12, 13.

and they perished in the waters of the flood. In the time of Abraham, mercy ceased to plead with the guilty inhabitants of Sodom, and all but Lot with his wife and two daughters were consumed by the fire sent down from heaven. So in the days of Christ. The Son of God declared to the unbelieving Jews of that generation, 'Your house is left unto you desolate.' Looking down to the last days, the same infinite power declares, concerning those who 'received not the love of the truth, that they might be saved,' 'For this cause God shall send them strong delusion, that they should believe a lie: that they all might be damned who believed not the truth, but had pleasure in unrighteousness.' As they reject the teachings of His Word, God withdraws His Spirit, and leaves them to the deceptions which they love."]"65 [emphasis added]

In response to this we can only repeat St. Paul's admonition:

"I marvel that ye are so soon removed from Him that called you into the grace of Christ unto another gospel: Which is not another; but there be some that trouble you, and would pervert the gospel of Christ. But though we, or an angel from heaven, preach any other gospel unto you than that which we have preached unto you, let him be accursed." Gal 1:6-8

Conclusion

We have invested a significant amount of time studying Ellen White's writings and Adventist doctrine for the past year. We have not found answers to every question of ours, but we are certain that much of what Ellen White has written is in error and those errors are reflected in Adventist doctrine and teachings. We will continue to search the Scriptures and pray for guidance in our studies. We again quote Ellen White, an admonition she claimed that, "God has opened before [her] in vision" 66:

"If you refuse to believe until every shadow of uncertainty and every possibility of doubt is removed, you will never believe. The doubt that demands perfect knowledge will never yield to faith. Faith rests upon evidence, not demonstration. The Lord requires us to obey the voice of duty, when there are other voices all around us urging us to pursue an opposite course. It requires earnest attention from us to distinguish the voice which speaks from God." EGW (1882)

...Or to quote an almost identical passage by Daniel March, a writer favored by Ellen White, who penned his lines thirteen years earlier:

"We must not defer our obedience till every shadow of uncertainty and every possibility of mistake is removed." "The doubt that demands perfect knowledge will never yield to faith, for faith rests upon probability, not demonstration. . . We must obey the voice of duty when there are many other voices crying against it, and it requires earnest heed to distinguish the one which speaks for God." Obaniel March (1869)

We pray that we will all find and embrace Christ's perfect love and truth.

We know that many in our own family and our Adventist friends have kept us in their prayers and fear for our eternal salvation. Please be assured that we will seek out Christian fellowship with believers that exalt the Name of Jesus and believe the Bible alone to be the inspired Word of God.

⁶⁵ Ellen G. White, <u>Early Writings</u> (1882), p. 44, from www.whiteestate.org.

⁶⁶ Ellen G. White, Selected Messages, Book. 1, 1882, p. 27

⁶⁷ Ibid.

⁶⁸ Daniel March, Night Scenes in the Bible, (1869)

Appendix I: <u>A Labor History Timeline</u> from Labornet (www.igc.apc.org)

- 1636 Maine Indentured Servants' and Fishermen's Mutiny
- 1661 Virginia Indentured Servants' Plot
- 1663 Maryland Indentured Servants' Strike
- 1675 Boston Ship Carpenters' Protest
- 1676 Bacon's Rebellion in Virginia
- 1677 New York City Carters' Strike
- 1684 New York City Carters' Strike
- 1741 New York City Bakers' Strike
- 1768 Florida Indentured Servants' Revolt New York City Tailor's Strike
- 1774 Hibernia, New Jersey, Ironworks Strike
- 1786 Shay's Rebellion in western Massachussettes
- 1791 Philadelphia carpenters carry out the first strike in the building trades
- 1805 A journeymen cordwainers' union in New York City includes a closed-shop clause in its constitution
- 1806 Philadelphia showmakers found guilty of criminal conspiracy after striking for higher wages
- 1827 Philadelphia Carpenters' Strike
- 1828 Paterson, New Jersey, Textile Strike
- 1831 Lynn, Massachusetts, Shoebinders' Protest
- 1833 Lynn, Massachusetts, Shoebinders' Protest begins. Manayunk, Pennsylvania, Textile Strike New York City Carpenters' Strike
- 1834 Manayunk, Pennsylvania, Textile Strike
- 1835 Paterson, New Jersey, Textile Strike.
- 1836 Lowell, Massachusetts, Mill Women's Strike New York City Tailors' Strike Philadelphia Bookbinders' Strike
- 1842 Anthracite Coal Strike
- 1850 New York City Tailors' Strike
- 1860 New England Shoemakers' Strike
- 1866 Molders' Lockout
- 1868 Anthracite Coal Strike
- 1874 Tompkins Square Riot in New York City
- 1875 Conviction of Molly Maguires for anthracite coalfield murders - twenty are eventually hanged Anthracite Coal Strike
- 1877 Federal and state troops are called out to crush the first nationwide strike in US history when railroad workers walk off their jobs

Cigarmakers' Strike

San Francisco Anti-Chinese Riots

Members of the militant Molly Maguires, a rank and file anthracite coal miners' organization, are hanged after being framed by a Pinkerton spy

1882 Cohoes, New York, Cotton Mill Strike

1883 Cowboy Strike

Lynchburg, Virginia, Tobacco Workers' Strike Molders' Lockout begins

1884 Fall River, Massachusettsm Textile Strike Union Pacific Railroad Strike

1885 Anti-Chinese Riots in the West

Cloakmakers' General Strike

McCormick Harvesting Machine Company Strike

Southwest Railroad Strike

Yonkers, New York, Carpet Weavers' Strike

1886 In Chicago, 350,000 workers demonstrate for the eight-hour workday, founding May Day as an international workers' holiday

Eight-hour-day movement fails "Haymarket Massacre" Police attack Haymarket Square labor rally in Chicago, sparking violence and the frame up of eight labor leaders

Anti-Chinese riots

Augusta, Georgia, Textile Strike.

Cowboy Strike

Eight-Hour Day Strikes

McCormick Harvesting Machine Company Strike

Southwest Railroad Strike

Troy, New York, Collar Laundresses' Strike

1887 Seven anarchists sentenced to death for the Haymarket bombing five eventually executed).

Port of New York Longshoremen's Strike

1888 Burlington Railroad Strike

Cincinnati Shoemakers' Lockout

1889 Baseball Players' Revolt begins

Fall River, Massachusetts, Textile Strike

1890 Carpenters' Strike for the Eight-Hour Day

1891 Savannah, Georgia, Black Laborers' Strike Tennessee Miners' Strike

1892 Coeur d'Alene Miners' Strike

New Orleans General Strike

1894 Nationwide Rail Strike led by the American Railway Union in Pullman, Illinois paralyzes nation's transportation

Coxey's Army of the unemployed marches on Washington, DC

Cripple Creek, Colorado, Miners' Strike

Great Northern Railroad Strike

- 1895 Haverhill, Massachusetts, Shoe Strike
- 1896 Leadville, Colorado, Miners' Strike begins
- 1897 Lattimer, Pennsylvania, Massacre, a sheriff and deputies gun down 19 striking miners and wound 40 others during a peaceful protest
- 1898 Marlboro, Massachusetts, Shoe Workers' Strike begins
- 1899 Buffalo, New York, Grain Shovelers' Strike Cleveland, Ohio, Street Railway Workers' Strike Coeur d'Alene, Idaho, Miners' Strike New York City Newsboys' Strike

1900 Anthracite Coal Strike

Machinists' Strike

1901 Machinists' Strike

National Cash Register Strike

San Francisco Restaurant Workers' Strike Steel Strike

1902 Great Anthracite Coal Strike, miners walk off the job for 164 days

Chicago Teamsters' Strike

1903 Cripple Creek, Colorado, Miners' Strike begins Oxnard, California, Sugar Beet Strike

1903 Telluride, Colorado, Miners' Strike begins Utah Coal Strike begins

Page 18

Appendix II: Summary of Miller's 15 Predictions for Christ's Return to Earth

Prediction Number		Numerical	References and Comments		
1 1		= 2520	Lev. 26:18		
1			Jer. 15:4; Isa. 7:8; 2 Chron.		
	-677 B.C		33:9		
	1042		33.9		
		=1843			
2	7 x 36 = 2520		Duet. 15:1,2; Jer. 34:14		
	-677 B		(Captivity of Israel)		
		=1843	(Same as Prediction #1,		
	10.00		except different texts)		
	I.		,		
3	7 x 36 = 2520		Ez. 39:9,10		
	-677 B	B.C	(Start of weapon burning)		
		=1843	(Same as Prediction#1,		
			except different reasoning)		
	•				
4	Adam's fall + 6,000 yrs				
			Heb. 4:4; 9-11; 6 days of		
			creation x 1000		
		=1843	Anti-typical Sabbath of 1,000		
			years will begin (Rev. 10:6).		
			We are in the 7 th and final		
			millennium since Adam.		
5	7 x 7 =	= 49	Seven x seven Sabbaths, Ex.		
			31:15; Lev. 23:15, 16; Deut.		
			16:9; Lev. 23: 24, 25; 25:3,4		
	X 50		Jubilee years		
	= 2450				
	- 607 (B.C.)	Josiah's reign ends, 2Ki.		
			23:2; 2 Chron. 35, 36; Jer. 22		
	=1843				
(2000		Hos. 6: 1-3; Rev. 10:6; Dan.		
6	2000				
	150 (D.C.)	9:23, 1 Maccabees 8,9		
	- 158 (B.C.)	(see proof 15) End of 2 nd millennium		
	=1842	_1042	Start of 3 rd millennium		
		=1843	Start of 3 millennium		
7	2300		Dan. 8:14 (beginning in 457		
′	2300		BC?)		
	- 490		70 weeks (7x70) cut off, Dan		
	- 490		9::20-27		
	= 1810)	72V 21		
	+ 33 (A.D.)		Christ's death		
	=1843		Cirist 5 death		
	I .	-1043	<u> </u>		
8	677 (B	(C)	Manasseh carried to		
	U// (D		Babylon?; Ez 12:10-15; Jer.		
			15:4		
	+ 538	(A D)	Fled into wilderness?		
	+ 538 (A.D.) = 1215		ried into whidefiless!		
	- 1213	,			
	539 (A	D)			
	538 (A + 1260		21/ vr (time times 1/ time)		
)	3½ yr (time, times, ½ time)		
	1798		Papacy wounded?		

Prediction Number		Numerical Calculation	References and Comments
	1260		
	- 1215		
	+ 1798	.	
	1770	= 1843	
•	1700		W 1: C 0
9	1798 - 1290		Wounding of papacy? Dan 7:11-13
	= 508		
	$\frac{-308}{+1335}$	<u> </u>	Set up of papal Rome? Dan 7:11-13
	+ 1333	= 1843	Daii 7.11-13
	1	10.0	L
10	158 (B	.C.)	Dragon began power over the saints?
	+ 2000)	Rev. 12: 3,9
	= 1842		Rev. 12. 3,9
	1042	+1 = 1843	The 3 rd day (millennium)
		1 10.0	begins?
			(Similar to Prediction #6)
11	1299		Turk incursion into Greece
	+ 150		5 mos. X 30 days (Rev. 9:5)
	= 1449)	Trumpet ended
	+ 406		391+15 of Rev.9:15
		= 1843	
12	520		n i
12	538 + 1260	<u> </u>	Papacy began
	+ 1260	,	2 witnesses in sackcloth (Rev. 11:3)
	= 1798	2	Kev. 11.3)
	1//0	??→ 1843	Trumpets terminate?? (Rev
		VV 2 10 10	11:14,15)
13	538		Papacy
	+ 1260)	Times, time, ½ time (Rev. 12:6)
	= 1798	3	It is not clear what this one
			has to do with 1843.
			Seems to be a repeat of the
	<u> </u>		above proofs.
1.4	1260		Earty and 2 mag (Day 12:5)
14	1260 + 538		Forty and 2 mos. (Rev. 13:5) Power to pope
	= 1798	<u> </u>	Power to pope Power ended
	1290	,	Dan. 12:11
	1335		Dan, 12:12
	1555	= 1843	Somehow end up with 1843
	1		
15	158 B.	C.	Beast of Rev. 13:18 (reverse
			reckoning) Start of pagan
			Rome?
	+ 666		Mark of beast
	= 508		Set up of papal Rome
	+ 1335		Dan. 12:12
		= 1843	